POLICY PAPER

No. 10 (58), April 2013 © PISM

Editors: Marcin Zaborowski (Editor-in-Chief) ● Wojciech Lorenz (Managing Editor)

Jarosław Ćwiek-Karpowicz ● Artur Gradziuk ● Piotr Kościński

Roderick Parkes ● Marcin Terlikowski ● Beata Wojna

Energy and Meat: Towards Better Polish–Saudi Relations

Kinga Brudzińska, Patrycja Sasnal, Bartosz Wiśniewski

Poland and Saudi Arabia share a counterintuitive commonality of features and interests. Both are regional "middle powers," and Poland's energy poor but agriculturally strong economy makes it surprisingly compatible with the energy rich, agriculturally weak Saudi Arabia. Yet bilateral relations between these nations leave a lot to be desired. There are at least three domains in which relatively little effort could bring much progress in releasing the potential of these relations.

Key recommendations:

- Poland and Saudi Arabia should consider reviving the idea of establishing a Joint Energy Commission;
- As a goodwill gesture towards better economic cooperation, both countries should do their utmost to lift the ban on Polish meat exports;
- It would be profitable to establish bilateral funds supporting joint business projects in the private and public sectors as well as initiate a study on identifying third-party intermediaries;
- In order to increase the visibility of Polish and Saudi universities in both countries, it is recommended to start a modest campaign of advertising Polish universities in Saudi schools and reestablish Saudi grants for Polish students;
- The two countries could also work together in the field of systemic transformation.

Poland and the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (KSA) are not incomparable economies. Poland's population, at approximately 38 million, is 10 million people stronger than that of Saudi Arabia, but wealth per capita is comparable (GNI at 24,700 in the KSA and 20,400 in Poland). This, and the strength of the Polish economy, derived from size and diversity which the KSA lack, mean that it is only geographically that the two countries are thousands of miles apart. Not only is per capita wealth surprisingly comparable, but other crucial indicators also come equally close. In 2012, unemployment stood at 12.2% in the KSA¹ and 12.8% in Poland.² In some aspects, Poland has a distinct advantage over the KSA (for example, the literacy rate is 100% in Poland, but 87% in the KSA³). It is possession of one quarter of the world's oil reserves that makes Saudi Arabia the economic kingmaker, and in those terms, countries with even the strongest of economies can only strive to become equal partners to the Kingdom. Poland, with its growing potential, can and

¹ "Country Report: Saudi Arabia," Economist Intelligence Unit, March 2013.

² Unemployment rate 1990–2013, Central Statistical Office, www.stat.gov.pl/gus/5840_677_ENG_HTML.htm.

³ According to World Bank Data statistics in 2010. See http://databank.worldbank.org.

should join the club. "Among EU countries, Poland has made the most cumulative progress over the past five years towards being a top global performer." But the comparability of the Saudi and Polish economies alone does not justify the need for stronger bilateral engagement. It is their compatibility that does so.

Poland produces agricultural commodities, of the kind sought after by the KSA. Saudi Arabia exports oil products and looks to excel in other means of energy production. Both resources and know-how are needed in Poland. Add to this the two countries' comparable economies and relative regional strength, and there is a solid basis for fruitful economic relations. Yet political and social ties—the linchpin of all other relations—are at least as unexplored as the economic connections, keeping both countries from moving beyond the potentiality phase in bilateral relations.

State of Play

With fewer than 20 years of diplomatic relations,⁵ Poland and Saudi Arabia remain friendly but still distant partners. A divergence of interests, preoccupation with regional issues and the lack of traditionally close ties are among the main causes of the relatively low intensity of political dialogue.⁶ However, both countries perceive themselves as important partners in their respective regions.⁷ For example, in 2007 Poland was chosen as the first destination of the Saudi ruler to an eastern European country. In April 2012 Polish Prime Minister Donald Tusk paid a visit to Saudi Arabia. Examples of mutual interests are mostly demonstrated by business relationships that include, amongst others, the opening of the Saudi Basic Industries Corporation office in Warsaw in 2004, the establishment of a Polish branch office of Zamil Steel in 2001, and Saudi Amiantit's investments in Gdansk in 1991.

Trade & Investments

Economic cooperation between Poland and Saudi Arabia is developing slowly but steadily. The volume of trade between the two countries reflects this. In 2000, Polish-Saudi trade stood at \$49.7 million; by 2005 it was almost five times bigger (\$233.7 million), and today Saudi Arabia is Poland's second largest partner in the Middle East⁸ (after Israel), and the largest in the Arab world. According to Polish sources the volume of bilateral trade in 2011 amounted to \$538.4 million,⁹ while Saudi authorities published a substantially higher figure, \$766 million. The volume of trade carried out by other nations reselling Polish products is the probable cause of this difference. Among these possible trade intermediaries are Germany, France, the UK and Italy, as Saudi Arabia's trade partners, and the Netherlands, Ireland and Denmark, which, unlike Poland, can export meat to Saudi Arabia.¹⁰ Due to the lack of detailed data, it is virtually impossible to track the trade routes of Polish products to Saudi Arabia without meticulous field research.

Despite the growing volume of bilateral trade, neither country takes full advantage of their economic relations, for at least two reasons. Firstly, the Saudi market is for now too open and too competitive for Polish companies. Secondly, Saudi Arabia considers western Europe a more attractive partner in terms of investment opportunities. Poland suffers from being perceived in Saudi Arabia as a post-communist country,

⁴ And it "made more progress in improving its business environment during the period June 2011 to June 2012 than any other country worldwide." In "Poland: A Top Performer in Doing Business," The World Bank, 23 October 2012, www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2012/10/23/poland-a-top-performer-in-doing-business; also in "Doing Business 2013: Smarter Regulations for Small and Medium-Size Enterprises," The World Bank & The International Finance Corporation, 23 October 2012, www.doingbusiness. org/~/media/GIAWB/Doing%20Business/Documents/Annual-Reports/English/DB13-full-report.pdf.

⁵ Poland and Saudi Arabia established full diplomatic relations on 3 May, 1995, in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Republic of Poland, www.rijad.msz.gov.pl/en/bilateral cooperation/business/polishsaudi economic relations.

⁶ Since 1995 there have been three high-level visits: In 2004 the President of Poland, Mr. Aleksander Kwaśniewski visited the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, in 2007 King Abdullah bin Abdel-Aziz al-Saud paid a visit to Poland, and in 2012 the Polish Prime Minister Donald Tusk went to the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia.

⁷ Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Republic of Poland, Polish-Saudi Economic Relations, www.rijad.msz.gov.pl/en/bilateral_cooperation/business/polishsaudi economic relations.

⁸ By the Middle East we mean the Arab world and Israel, excluding Turkey and Iran.

⁹ The Official Statistical Office, Yearbook of Foreign Trade Statistics 2012, p. 120, www.stat.gov.pl/cps/rde/xbcr/gus/RS_rocznik_statystyczny_handlu_zagranicznego_2012.pdf.

¹⁰ The Royal Embassy of Saudi Arabia in Poland, Kingdom Economy, www.saudiembassy.pl, and The European Commission, were informed by the Saudi Food & Drug Authority that the Netherlands, Ireland and Denmark can export meat to Saudi Arabia because authorisation was granted by a different authority, before the import procedure introduced by the Saudi Food & Drug Authority, in: http://madb.europa.eu/madb/sps_barriers_details.htm?barrier_id=040027&version=10.

most likely struggling to stay in the race, rather than the fastest growing EU economy that is the reality. In this respect, Poland appears, albeit unjustly, less competitive than Saudi Arabia's traditional European partner markets. Regardless of the issue of Poland's image, it also appears that there is no chance of greater Saudi private investment in Poland without an investment protection agreement, financial and investment instruments at the governmental level, and public trade and investment promotion sections.¹¹

Agriculture

Trade of commodities and other agricultural products could become an exemplary field of common interest and business making in Polish–Saudi relations for a combination of reasons. Firstly, agricultural products represent a relatively large proportion of Poland's overall exports, exceeding 12% and still growing. Secondly, Saudi Arabia faces local challenges to secure affordable food for its residents, and it seeks to diversify its supply partners. As a result, Poland is seen as a target at least for meat, apples and poultry. Saudi Arabia is the biggest market in the region for Polish companies in terms of groceries, soft drinks, machinery, equipment for restaurants and manufacturing plants. In 2012, Polish exports to Saudi Arabia rose by 88% compared to 2011, a rise which is mainly accredited to an increase in the export of cheese, chocolate, and products containing cocoa and wheat. There is an even greater potential in exporting poultry, dairy products, juices and concentrates, tea, herb mixes, and confectionery.

Nevertheless, there are currently two main limitations to the further development of cooperation between Poland and Saudi Arabia. First of all, the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) import ban on livestock and related products—such as deboned meat—from the EU¹³ on BSE grounds has been in place since 2001. Secondly, on I January 2013 Poland banned ritual slaughtering without stunning.¹⁴

Discussion about lifting the Saudi ban on importing Polish meat has been ongoing since 2011, but even this seemingly easily reversible bureaucratic obstacle proved insurmountable. However, some steps were taken. On 20 January the Polish Embassy in Riyadh received information from the Saudi authorities on the requirements which should be met in order to enable Polish producers to export red meat to Saudi Arabia, together with a notification that the Saudis are willing to carry out an inspection mission to Poland in June–July. At the same time, the Polish General Veterinary Inspectorate informed the Saudi side that Poland had banned ritual slaughter and requested information about whether ritual slaughter with reversible stunning, 15 which is still legal in Poland, could be acceptable to Saudi Arabia.

In the case of red meat, where there is no institutional framework or legal possibility for export, Polish producers have grown accustomed to the situation. They are satisfied to sell their goods to a less demanding market closer to Poland at a lower price, rather than pushing the authorities to complete the legal process so they can expand. Hence it is common practice that Polish agricultural products are resold by third-party countries to Saudi Arabia and elsewhere in Asia. There is not any business pressure on the authorities in Saudi Arabia either, which means that Polish and Saudi companies and producers are discouraged from cooperating either by natural lack of business opportunities (this option seems less likely as Saudi Arabia does need a diversified food supply), or by the absence of any formal state-approved legal basis for cooperation.

_

¹¹ Investments using capital from Saudi Arabia are currently made through specialised funds registered in western Europe and the United States, which means that they are not included in the Polish trade statistics, in: The Chancellery of the Prime Minister, www.kprm.gov.pl/en/news/aktualnosci/prime-ministers-visit-to-the-united-arab-emirates-and-saudi-arabia.html.

¹² It relies on nine partners for 90% of its food imports: Brazil, the EU, India, Canada, Ukraine, Argentine, the U.S., Australia and Russia. In reply to food security concerns, King Abdullah established the Initiative for Agro-Investment Overseas, which aims at providing funds, credit and logistics to Saudi Investors to invest aboard in agriculture, and at establishing a strategic reserve for basic food commodities.

¹³ The European Commission was informed by the Saudi Food & Drug Authority that the Netherlands, Ireland and Denmark can export meat to Saudi Arabia because the authorisation was granted by a different authority, before the import procedure introduced by the Saudi Food & Drug Authority, in: http://madb.europa.eu/madb/sps_barriers_details.htm?barrier_id=040027 &version=10.

¹⁴ Ritual slaughter does not accept stunning the animal before killing it. In 2012, Poland had 17 cattle and 12 poultry slaughterhouses which practiced ritual slaughter. In November 2012 the European Union set a directive on ritual slaughter (but allowed individual countries discretion on whether to apply these rules). The Polish Constitutional Court ruled on 28 November 2012 that ritual slaughter of animals for kosher and halal meat violates the Polish Constitution. The court's decision came into force on 1 January 2013, http://jurist.org/paperchase/2012/11/poland-court-rules-ritual-slaughter-of-animals-violates-constitution.php.

¹⁵ Technically the procedure could be deemed religiously appropriate as it allows the heart to beat while the animal is unconscious.

Energy

Three particularly promising areas of cooperation in the immediate future could be nuclear power generation, the implications of the greater use of renewable energy, and the promising potential of unconventional oil and gas exploration and production. Saudi Arabia is aiming at a much broader application of nuclear power, which is intended to both add to its electricity generation capacity and support energyintensive water desalination facilities. 16 Saudi plans are therefore more ambitious in terms of the size of the nuclear capacity (up to 16 GW by 2030, compared with 6 GW envisaged by Poland), but come with practical challenges similar to those faced by Poland with respect to nuclear safety and security and waste management, which in turn require a build-up of sound regulatory and oversight expertise. Both countries have cooperation agreements with leaders in nuclear power generation (including the United States, France, and South Korea), and should consider sharing their experience with leveraging foreign assistance to achieve the maximum benefit for domestic engineering skills.

Saudi Arabia is uniquely positioned to become a worldwide leader in the expansion of both photovoltaic and solar thermal energy in the coming years. The latest announcements indicate that Saudi Arabia intends to derive as much as 41 GW from solar power by 2030, thus becoming a champion of the renewable energy industry.¹⁷ Poland's plans to arrive at a 15.5% share of renewables in primary energy supply by 2020, in line with the EU climate policy, will be achieved largely via further expansion of wind and biomass energy, with photovoltaics adding only a fraction of the total electricity generation potential. Still, Poland and Saudi Arabia should consider sharing practical knowledge, best practices and (possibly) undertaking joint research into the implications of the addition of different sorts of so-called intermittent sources of energy supply for the safety of their electrical grids. In addition, experts and industry representatives from both countries could explore the potential requirements for new power generation units, as those extant in Poland (coal) and Saudi Arabia (oil) are being decommissioned.

Finally, Polish-Saudi relations can benefit from both countries' interest in tapping into unconventional sources of hydrocarbons, most notably shale gas. Poland remains the European frontrunner when it comes to the exploration of shale deposits, and Saudi Arabia is about to launch first exploratory drillings in 2013.18 In each case, massive capital outlays and time-consuming analysis of the data acquired during testing will be necessary in order to get a more accurate assessment of the potential (as is usually the case with these deposits, initial estimates indicate that shale gas endowment could be significantly greater than that of conventional reservoirs), and the actual commercial viability of shale-locked resources. In the meantime, Polish and Saudi authorities will need to become sufficiently acquainted with the requirements associated with developing unconventional deposits, which differ substantially from those already mastered by the energy resources sector. To that end, Poland and Saudi Arabia would be well advised to rely on foreign expertise, while at the same time putting in place mechanisms for sharing early experience with managing the technical and environmental aspects of shale oil and gas production. Saudi Arabia is likely to encounter different challenges due to demanding geographical conditions. Potential water shortages arising from an inadequate water supply are likely to feature more prominently in the Saudi case, but are also a source of concern in Poland. Practical Polish-Saudi cooperation could therefore focus on effective water cycle management, as well as on developing, or perfecting, alternative, innovative ways of shale rock stimulation, such as so-called dry fracking.

Society

If societal relations have formed the basis for fruitful cooperation elsewhere, Poland and Saudi Arabia have only just started in this endeavour. The decoupling of Polish Siamese twins in 2005 in Riyadh is often cited as a milestone in this regard, but even though the operation may have made Saudi Arabia better known and more popular in Poland, and perhaps back then Poland became the talk of the day in Saudi Arabia, it was nevertheless one among dozens of similar operations performed in Riyadh over the following years.

¹⁶ Eman El-Shenawi, Saudi Arabia plans to build 16 nuclear reactors by 2030, Al-Arabiya News, 2 June 2011, www.alarabiya.net/ articles/2011/06/02/151472.html.

¹⁷ W. Mahdi, M. Roca, "Saudi Arabia Plans \$109 Billion Boost for Solar Power," Bloomberg, 11 May 2012, www.bloomberg.com/ news/2012-05-10/saudi-arabia-plans-109-billion-boost-for-solar-power.html.

18 S. Hall, "Saudi Arabia to Drill for Shale Gas This Year," *The Wall Street Journal*, 18 March 2013, http://online.wsj.com/

article/SB10001424127887323415304578367912966011422.html.

Bilateral societal cooperation has not advanced due, among other reasons, to a low level of people-to-people contacts. Closer cooperation in "track-two" diplomacy, especially in the field of research and education, could help develop social relations and broaden the networking possibilities.

One beacon of change is the growing number of Saudi students in Poland, mainly studying medicine and technical studies, although some of them also study foreign languages. In the current academic year there are 456 Saudi students in Poland, compared with 122 in 2009/2010. Saudi Arabia is interested in taking advantage of the higher education sector in Poland, particularly in the areas of medicine and technical studies. Likewise, Polish universities would of course like to nurture their cooperation with Saudi universities. To that end many, of them participate in education fairs and will take part in the International Exhibition and Conference on Higher Education in Riyadh in April. Since education is a uniquely state domain, unlike business, it does receive official backing; no official visit of the Polish Minister of Science and Higher Education is planned for the first half of 2013.

Polish students, on the other hand, do not study in Saudi Arabia as other European Union countries offer much more competitive scholarships and, are closer to home. Additionally, the Saudi Arabian scholarship scheme for Polish students, granted between 2009 and 2011, is no longer in place, 19 and there is a strong language barrier. As a result of the latter, Saudi students often have to take a language course prior to enrolment, which takes time and money, and not all medical and technical Polish universities offer such courses. Furthermore, not all Saudi students get accepted to the best Polish universities (Warsaw, Krakow and Poznan). They study mostly in Olsztyn and Lublin. One of the reasons is that Saudi students score lower than other English-speaking candidates in entrance exams (for example in medicine), and there are no special placements in Poland for students from Saudi Arabia.

Recommendations

Bringing the relations to the next level would require solid pillars that ensure mutual interest in developing cooperation. In the case of Saudi Arabia and Poland, energy, trade and investment, as well as "track-two" diplomacy could form such a basis.

First and foremost, Poland and Saudi Arabia should consider reviving the idea of establishing a Joint Energy Commission, first floated in 2007 during the Saudi Oil Minister's visit to Poland. More broadly, a Joint Energy Commission could undertake or commission a comprehensive study of ways to ensure the expansion of the domestic nuclear industry beyond the task of emissions-free electricity generation, for example into the realm of applying nuclear-related research for medical purposes. It is also in both countries' interests to attract, at the earliest stages of their quests for unconventional hydrocarbons, the most advanced technology available, and to keep track of the most recent best practices (environmental, regulatory and business-related) in the field. More generally, initialising a Polish–Saudi energy dialogue could in itself become a natural incentive for further cooperation.

Undeniably, it will take more than just government-driven, top-down incentives to invigorate Polish-Saudi business relations, but there is little in the way of Saudi and Polish governments working on lifting the export ban on Polish meat. The Saudi veterinary inspection mission to Poland, planned for June-July 2013, is a good sign. The inspectors could simultaneously visit red meat and poultry manufacturers, but so far the plan is only to inspect the former. Lifting the export ban would suffice to improve formal conditions for bilateral trade without necessarily reintroducing ritual slaughtering in Poland as there are alternative humanitarian ways of slaughtering animals that may seem religiously acceptable. Other simple procedures could easily be implemented, such as facilitating a registration and licensing system by using electronic registration ("The Local Food Establishments Registration and Licensing System"), an indispensable feature in trading with Saudi Arabia.²⁰ It would speed up the process of obtaining

_

¹⁹ Scholarships for studying at the King Abdullah University of Science and Technology were meant for students at the end of their bachelor's or master's degree, studying computer science, applied mathematics, chemistry, biotechnology, electronics, environmental protection, environmental science, engineering, materials science and engineering and mechanics. The Polish universities which participated in the exchange were the University of Technology in Krakow (Politechnika Krakowska), the University of Economy in Bydgoszcz (Wyższa Szkoła Gospodarki w Bydgoszczy), and the University of Technology in Warsaw (Politechnika Warszawska).

²⁰ Similar systems have already been created by the Saudi Food and Drug Authority. See www.sfda.gov.sa/en/eservices/Pages/default.aspx.

a licence for Polish companies. Thirdly, the Saudi Embassy in Poland and the Polish Embassy in Riyadh should be updated regularly about the companies willing to do business in Saudi Arabia and vice versa. They could then provide detailed information to the interested parties and facilitate the organisation of business missions to the respective countries.²¹

Trade flow and investment should be facilitated thanks to the double taxation evasion agreement signed by both governments in 2011 (in force since I January). However, it would be profitable to establish bilateral funds supporting joint business projects in private and public sectors (Saudi Arabia Fund may serve as a good example). The Polish-Saudi holding company to be launched in 2013 also has some potential in this regard. The company was set up to spur investment activity in Saudi Arabia and Poland, by establishing joint service and industrial projects backed by Polish technologies. The company would actively promote 'business matching' events and people-to-people contacts, with a target trade flow of \$2 million.

Another recommendable step would be to tweak the current promotional mechanisms by establishing better information and media cooperation to promote Saudi products in Poland and vice versa. This could be done through, for example, carefully-tailored trade fairs, and advertising adapted to local needs. Needless to say, a direct flight connection between Poland and Saudi Arabia could largely facilitate contacts with the whole Gulf Region. In this regard, United Arab Emirates and Qatar are more advanced, as both have opened direct Warsaw–Dubai (February) and Warsaw–Doha connections (December 2012). These direct connections already bring Poland and the GCC closer together.

With regard to cooperation in the field of education, and in order to increase the visibility of Polish and Saudi universities in both countries, it is recommended that a modest campaign of advertising Polish universities in Saudi schools be started, and that Saudi grants for Polish students are re-established. Common relations could also be improved by putting more public focus on occasions such as awards ceremonies. The Lech Walesa Award in 2008, which was bestowed on Abdullah Bin Abdul-Aziz Al Saud, King of Saudi Arabia, is a good example. King Abdullah was awarded for promoting dialogue between religions and acting for peace in the Middle East. It is worth mentioning that in March 2012, Polish academia was granted, for the first time ever, an invitation to nominate candidates for the King Faisal International Prize (called the "Arab Nobel"), which is bestowed in five disciplines (Service to Islam, Islamic Studies, Arabic Language and Literature, Medicine, and Science).²² Finally, cooperation in the field of archaeology is another unexplored realm. Historically, Polish archaeologists have vast experience in excavations in the Arab world. Better understanding of both countries' heritage would facilitate development of people-to-people contact. A current idea of displaying "The Masterpieces of Saudi Archaeology" in Poland is yet to bear fruit.

Finally, the two countries could also work together in the field of systemic transformation. Poland successfully experienced such transformation, while Saudi Arabia is undergoing reform and promoting it elsewhere in the Arab world. Some aspects of the Polish experience of peaceful transformation could be relevant in Saudi Arabia. This is especially true in terms of transformation that goes hand in hand with modernisation of all sectors and brings gradual and carefully considered solutions to the difficulties related to transformation, and could later be applied in other Arab countries (in particular in Tunisia and Libya). Such cooperation would be mutually beneficial, as it could strengthen the Polish presence in the Middle East and North Africa and fits Saudi foreign policy goals shared by Poland, such as promoting regional stability.

²¹ Polish producers of electric and mechanic goods (~30% of Polish exports), the paper industry, producers of agro products (i.e., 12 Polish manufacturers of poultry), chemical goods, furniture, and a few construction companies, are currently interested in investing in Saudi Arabia.

²² The King Faisal International Prize (KFIP) for the year 1435H / 2014G, ww.kff.com/en01/kfip/KFIPTopicsIntro1435H2014G.html.